ABERDEEN CITY COUNCIL

COMMITTEE	City Growth and Resources
DATE	28 October 2020
EXEMPT	No
CONFIDENTIAL	No
REPORT TITLE	Financial Settlement from Transport Scotland for the De-trunking of the A92/A96
REPORT NUMBER	OPE/20/113.
DIRECTOR	Rob Polkinghorne
CHIEF OFFICER	Mark Reilly
REPORT AUTHOR	Doug Ritchie
TERMS OF REFERENCE	1.1.7: 1.1.8: 2.1.2 & 4.1

1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

1.1 To update the committee on the outcome of negotiations with Transport Scotland and the financial settlement achieved for investment in the de-trunked sections of the A92 and A96.

2. RECOMMENDATION(S)

That the Committee

2.1 Note the funding being awarded by Transport Scotland for the work required to be carried out on the detrunked section of road as of 1st April 2019. (See Appendix A)

2.2. Delegate authority to the Chief Officer – Operations and Protective Services to accept the current agreed figures with Transport Scotland.

2.3 Instruct the Chief Officer – Operations and Protective Services to add the agreed repairs to our current works programme and implement the required repairs in order to maintain these roads to the required standards.

3. BACKGROUND

3.1 Following the opening of all sections of the Aberdeen Western Peripheral Route, the existing A92 and A96 through the City were transferred as part of the detrunking process to Aberdeen City Council on the 1st April 2019. A total of 44 km of mainly Dual Carriageway, associated footpaths, 23 structures including two major river bridges, traffic signals and landscaped areas were returned to the Council for on-going upkeep and maintenance.

It should be noted that the current section of the existing trunk road from Middlefield Place to Haudagain Roundabout on the A92 and Haudagain Roundabout to Auchmill Terrace on the A96 will not be detrunked until the first April 1st after completion of the new duelled section at Manor Drive/ Manor

Avenue. This section of the A92/A90 will be subject to a further round of de-trunking meetings with Transport Scotland to determine the level of outstanding work required to these roads at point of handover. This next negotiation is anticipated to be completed more quickly with only a small payment from Transport Scotland expected.

There are three general principles adopted by Transport Scotland when considering the financial settlement that will be made at the time of detrunking. These principles are used to determine what would be included as detrunking works and what would be omitted.

3.1.1 The detrunking works should be sufficient such that the detrunked sections of the road network provide a level of service in all categories similar or greater to the level of service provided on average by the road network in the North East of Scotland Trunk Road Unit as a whole. It should be noted that a "mature" road such as the A92 through Aberdeen will by virtue of its age and usage not be in brand new condition. As with the whole North East of Scotland Trunk Road Unit, the road can be expected to have defects that constitute a reduction in level of service or amenity, involve a risk of structural deterioration or risk development into a Category 1 Defect at some time in the future, with all further costs being the responsibility of others.

3.1.2 The achievement of higher levels of service in any given category does not mean that lower levels of service than trunk road unit averages may be proposed in any other category.

3.1.3 De-trunking settlements are not intended to allow for designing road improvements, only manage the inherent condition of the existing infrastructure.

3.2 Adopted Asset

3.2.1 With the completion of the Aberdeen Western Peripheral Route on the 19th February 2019, the assets of the A92 and A96 were transferred, on 1st April 2019, to the Council's roads adopted network This transfer included all revenue costs associated with its maintenance.

3.2.2 The A92 Trunk Road (Charleston to Blackdog) De-trunking Order 2010 set out proposed de-trunking routes which includes Stonehaven Road, South Anderson Drive, Anderson Drive, North Anderson Drive, The Parkway, Ellon Road to Blackdog, Auchmill Road and Inverurie Road covering approximately 40 Kilometres. It should be noted that currently the section of A92 between Middlefield Place and Haudagain Roundabout and Haudagain Roundabout and Auchmill Terrace are excluded from the de-trunking order until such times as the Haudagain improvements have been completed.

3.2.3 The transfer of the asset to the Council incurred immediate annual maintenance costs that have had to be met from the existing resources It should be noted that the levels of inspection, response times winter maintenance etc. are not carried out to Trunk Road standards but have reverted to the current Council policies and procedures as agreed at the Operational Delivery Committee of the 14th March 2019.

Asset	Type	Quantity
Traffic Signals	Junctions and Crossings	31
Street Lighting	Lanterns	1084
Footway	Footway	35.0km
Carriageway	Dual	16.6km
	Double	1.2km
	Single	5.4km
	Roundabouts	2.0km
Drainage	Gullies	1115
	Network	90km
Structures	Major Bridges	2
	Other Bridges	2
	Retaining Walls	
	Culverts	11
	Underpasses	5
	Bridge of Dee Flood Tunnels	

3.2.4 Transport Scotland have funded the installation of traffic lights at the Kingswells South Junction between the A90 and the A944. These traffic lights are now part of the Councils assets and funded for management and maintenance from the Revenue budget.

3.2.5 A small staff resource will be required for a minimum of two years to promote and manage the schemes associated with the de-trunked sections of road

3.3 Bridge of Dee

3.3.1 The Bridge of Dee is one of the structures that was transferred to the Council as of 1st April 2019. There were some problems highlighted with the Structure which relate to the condition of the masonry on the bridge the Flood Tunnels and the scour around the Bridge Piers as a result of the flooding event of 2015/2016. A significant amount of the funds received to date relate to future works required to provide scour protection. Full details are contained in Appendix B

4. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

4.1 An initial payment for the de-trunking, of £3,656,170.79 was received by the Council in April 2019; a further payment of £4,414,626.56 was received in April 2020.

4.2 A request for payment of £479,000 for the revenue maintenance operations for the period 2019-2020 has been turned down by Transport Scotland with the following comment received:

"The position is that, given the overall funding settlement for Aberdeen City Council through the GAE assessment, a "floor" adjustment was made to

increase the level of funding made available to the Council. Had we made an adjustment to the Council's funding settlement to reflect the increased road length as a proportion of total road length in the GAE assessment the "floor" adjustment would have been adjusted accordingly and the Council would have been no better or worse off as a result."

4.3 £543,109.98 has been included in the payments to change existing lanterns to LEDs. This allows for 75% of lanterns on the A92 and A96 to be changed, this is to achieve the average condition of LED replacement on the North East Trunk Roads.

4.4 An estimated annual revenue budget will be required for the maintenance and management of the A92 and A96 of approx.£700,000. Full details are included in Appendix C. A proportion of this will have been received in the 2020-2021 grant funding to cover the increase in the council's maintained road lengths. The additional adopted road lengths will increase the pressures on both the roads revenue and capital budgets and as such there will need to be an ongoing re-evaluation of existing priorities.

4.5 The detrunked sections of the road are now covered by the Council's Inspection and maintenance procedures and as such will be subject to normal insurance claims from the general public. The Council's Insurance Company has been informed of the change in status of these roads.

5. LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

5.1 The Council is obligated under Section 34 of the Roads (Scotland) Act 1984 to take such steps as they consider reasonable to prevent snow and ice endangering the safe passage of pedestrians and vehicles over a public road. Failure to provide a robust and justifiable "Roads Winter Service Plan" including the de-trunked sections of road would leave the Council more vulnerable to legal challenges and 3rd party insurance claims.

6. MANAGEMENT OF RISK

	Risk	Low (L), Medium (M), High (H)	Mitigation
Financial	The additional road lengths and structures returned to the Council create additional demand for limited financial resources and may therefore impact on other maintenance budgets in the future. Potential increase in insurance claims	M	This will be minimised by prioritising works across the city, by using high-quality design and materials to ensure longevity of renewed infrastructure. Inspection regime for detrunked roads included within the existing inspection programmes of the city

Legal	There are risks in promoting Traffic Regulation Orders due to possible public objection and this may delay the progression of some of the proposed schemes. Lack of Investment in Roads will increase claims against the council	L	Ensure that orders are progressed taking into account the longest possible time required for delivery. Continue to prioritise spend in order to repair higher used higher damaged roads and footpaths
Employee	Staff resources	H	There is a need to ensure that there are sufficient adequately trained staff resources to deliver the proposed programmes within the specified timescales.
Customer	Increased perception of poor quality road infrastructure	H	The implementation of a detrunked roads works programme will assist roads and footways being maintained to an acceptable standard thus increasing ease of travel whilst reducing the risk to all members of the travelling public
Environment	The risks of inaction (not improving and increasing pedestrian and cycle infrastructure) are also significant in terms of a poor quality environment, poor reputation for Aberdeen and a decline in active travel which would have significant implications for the health and wellbeing of the citizens of Aberdeen	M	
Technology	Lack of Asset Management information to deliver annual work programme	M	Carry out a digital asset survey of the City Roads Infrastructure to manage the spend over several years and continue to optimise our use of resources to provide best value. Use the information obtained to update annually the Roads Asset Management Plan
Reputational	Lack of Investment in Roads will increase negative press involvement and claims against the council	M	Continue to prioritise spend in order to repair higher used higher damaged roads and footpaths. Works to be determined in line with Roads Asset Management Plan

7.

COUNCIL DELIVERY PLAN	
	Impact of Report
Aberdeen City Council Policy Statement 5. Commit extra funding to resurface damaged roads and pavements throughout the city.	£10 million extra funding provided over a 4-year period. Currently we are in year 3 of the current capital spend.

Aberdeen City Local Outcome Improvement Plan	
	Impact of Report
Prosperous Economy Stretch Outcomes	Investment in road's infrastructure will assist in maximising the economy of the city.
Prosperous People Stretch Outcomes	Using the roads and footways, street lighting and traffic safety measures to assist in making Safe and Resilient Communities for people to live in.
Prosperous Place Stretch Outcomes	Supporting different ways for active travel in everyday journeys, working with partners and volunteers to address safety, and infrastructure to assist in the increase of Active Travel.

	Impact of Report
Regional and City Strategies	The views of affected residents and road users are sought on our performance on specific schemes. Records held in the Confirm (Roads Maintenance Management) System and records of Claims by road users against alleged defects can be analysed to indicate areas of concern. Specific surveys may be carried out from time to time to address specific areas of concern. Results of these various analyses can be used in conjunction with inspection data to establish customers' areas of concern and expectations of the maintenance of the roads network.
Organisational Design	Our organisational structure is such that it reflects our services and the statutory duties we have to deliver.
Governance	The Asset Management Plan will be used to manage the allocated budget and spend over several years to continue to optimise our use of resources to continue to provide best value.

Workforce	Need to ensure that there are sufficient adequately trained staff resources to deliver the proposed programmes
Process Design	Required Technical staff to understand improved innovative processes that will assist in an improved service delivery and best value.
Technology	There is a need to modify the reporting systems from paper to digital in order that we can measure outputs
Partnerships and Alliances	Continue to improve on customer information relating to works delivery

8. IMPACT ASSESSMENTS

Assessment	Outcome
Equality & Human Rights Impact Assessment	This report has no direct implications in relation to Equalities and Human Rights Impact Assessment and as such a full EHRIA is not required. Funding received from Transport Scotland will be used to benefit all road users.
Data Protection Impact Assessment	Not required
Impact Assessment	Not Required

9. BACKGROUND PAPERS

https://committees.aberdeencity.gov.uk/documents/s108019/Signalisation%20report%20AWPR%20final.pdf

10. APPENDICES (if applicable)

Appendix A: Summary of Payment
Appendix B: Bridge of Dee Scour Assessment
Appendix C: Anticipated Revenue Expenditure

11. REPORT AUTHOR CONTACT DETAILS

Name Doug Ritchie
Title Roads Infrastructure Manager
Email Address dritchie@aberdeencity.gov.uk
Tel 01224-522325

Appendix A

Summary of Payments

A92

Ref	ITEM	Original Payment £	Additional Monies £	Revised Payment £	Traffic Management and Overheads £	Total Payment £
B1a	Works Necessary to Maintain Pavement Structural Integrity	177,325.77	930,663.52	1,107,989.24	506,452.53	1,661,984.24
B1b	Deflectograph derived pavement treatment; 0 years or less residual life	711,822.71	52,988.36	764,811.07	382,405.54	1,147,216.61
B2*	Works Necessary to Maintain Pavement Surface Condition	408,951.53	0.00	408,951.53	204,475.77	613,427.30
B3a	Works Necessary to Enable Effective Operation of Structural Elements	80,000.00	144,000.00	224,000.00	112,000.00	336,000.00
B4	Traffic Signals	201,145.13	63,570.60	264,715.73	132,357.87	397,073.60
B5	Works Necessary to Enable Effective Drainage of the Road Network	41,506.60	136,351.21	177,857.81	88,928.91	266,786.72
B6a**	Works to Enable Effective Illumination of Sections of the Road Network	50,250.00	0	52,250.00	26,125.00	78,375.00
B7	Works Necessary to Enable Effective Performance of Safety Barriers	12,581.20	6,351.00	18,932.20	9,466.10	28,398.30
B8	Works Necessary to Enable Effective Operation of the Road Network – Lines	98,140.60	78,744.00	176,884.60	88,442.30	265,326.90
B9	Works Necessary to Enable Effective Operation of the Road Network – Update Signs	125,172.94	9,083.60	134,256.54	67,128.27	201,384.81
B10	Landscaping, Planting Beds and Sponsorships	9,600.00	23,400.00	33,000.00	16,500.00	49,500.00
	TOTAL	1,916,496.48	1,445,152.29	3,361,648.77	1,680,824.39	5,042,473.16

A96

Ref	ITEM	Original Payment £	Additional Monies £	Revised Payment £	Traffic Management and Overheads £	Final Payment £
B1a	Works Necessary to Maintain Pavement Structural Integrity	95,084.28	0	95,084.28	47,542.14	142,626.42
B1b	Deflectograph derived pavement treatment; 0 years or less residual life	208,246.01	15,501.92	223,747.93	111,873.97	335,621.90
B2*	Works Necessary to Maintain Pavement Surface Condition	111,008.60	0.00	111,008.60	55,504.30	166,512.90
B3	Works Necessary to Enable Effective Operation of Structural Elements	35,000.00	6,000.00	41,000.00	20,500.00	61,500.00
B4	Traffic Signals – included in A92 works	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
B5	Works Necessary to Enable Effective Drainage of the Road Network	12,895.15	11,417.69	24,312.84	12,156.42	36,469.26
B6a	Works to Enable Effective Illumination of Sections of the Road Network	9,245.00	0	9245.00	4,622.50	13,867.50
B7**	Works Necessary to Enable Effective Performance of Safety Barriers	5,270.58	0.00	5,270.58	2,635.29	7,905.87
B8	Works Necessary to Enable Effective Operation of the Road Network – Lines	23,410.44	17,113.08	40,523.52	20,261.76	60,785.28
B9	Works Necessary to Enable Effective Operation of the Road Network – Update Signs	20,790.66	0.00	20,790.66	10,395.33	31,185.99
B10	Landscaping, Planting Beds and Sponsorships, included in A92 works	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
	SUB-TOTAL	520,950.72	55,146.61	576,097.33	288,048.67	864,146.00

Total for detrunking works £ 5,898,948.27

Other Payments

Change existing lanterns to LEDs. 75% of lanterns changed, A92 + A96 to achieve average condition. **£551,168.92**

Previously paid for bulk change	**£ 59,945.00**
Payment	**£491,223.92**

Installation of Traffic lights at Kingswells Roundabout **£375,000.00**

Costs Associated with the Maintenance of A92 and A96 for 2019-2020 **£479,000** has been rejected by Transport Scotland

Summary

Total for detrunking works	**£ 5,898,948.27**
Change existing lanterns to LEDs	**£ 491,223.92**
Installation of Traffic lights at Kingswells Roundabout	**£ 375,000.00**
River Dee Bridge Scouring (Initial Payment)	**£ 940,000.00**
Advanced Payment on Outstanding Items.	**£ 366,030.16**
	£8,071,202.35

Payments to date

£3,656,575.79
£4,414,626.56
£8.071,202.35

* Items B2 on the A92 and A96 are still under discussion as ACC do not agree with the proposed rate for the work

** Column Testing still in discussion

A further update will be provided to CG&R Committee once these figures have been finalised

Appendix B
Bridge of Dee
Level 2 Scour Assessment

A Level 2 Scour Assessment[1] carried out on 23rd May 2017 reported the following: -

"the overall structure of the bridge appears in good condition and any scour / undercut found during this survey was to the protecting bag work that surrounds all the piers and abutments. The scour protection aprons extend a minimum of 2.5m from the piers into the channel. As noted by the dive survey, some areas of the aprons are undermined by 200mm to 1200mm penetration from the front face of the apron. Based on the assumption that the remaining width of the protective aprons continue to provide adequate scour protection from the face of the piers the structure is considered to have a low risk of scour. However, as identified in the dive survey, further investigation is required to determine if the voids below the scour aprons in spans 2, 3 and 4 do threaten the integrity of the piers. It is recommended remedial works are undertaken to secure the edge protection, infill voids, cut back / treat woody vegetation and secure the surface of the apron".

Following the level 2 scour assessment; in August 2017 BEAR commissioned Jacobs to develop a set of construction options for the remediation and future resilience of the bridge pier foundations and river channel. This report was titled; A90 860 Bridge of Dee Scour Repair and Resilience Remedial Options Report Scheme and issued in February 2018. In addition to the task brief, BEAR provided underwater inspection reports dated 13th & 14th February 2016, but this was restricted due to fast flowing water and elevated water level.

A subsequent, more comprehensive survey was undertaken by UK Diving Services (Titanium (UK) Ltd) (UKDS) between the 17th to 20th September 2016, utilising sonar to supplement the underwater inspection. This survey identified that the submerged elements of the bridge could be categorised in two halves, left and right. The right abutment and Piers 4, 5 and 6 were considered, by UKDS, to be in "good condition". The submerged elements associated with the left abutment and Piers 1, 2 and 3 were considered to be in "poor condition". UKDS noted that the river at this location had a greater flow and that there was a commensurate difference in the erosion and scouring effect on the submerged concrete bag work edge protection to the aprons. The survey also noted that at worst, the concrete bag work is loose and in the vicinity of Piers 1, 2 and 3 entire courses of concrete bags have been lost. Within Spans 1, 2, 3 and 4 the river bed level was noted to be between 200-400mm lower compared to the river bed level recorded during the February 2016 inspection exposing the bed work at this location. However, at the middle of the left side on Pier 2 the bed level was noted to have dropped 900mm between the February and September 2016 surveys.

A repeat survey undertaken by UKDS in October 2017 noted that generally river bed levels had fluctuated by +/- 100mm, with the exception of Span 2 (the right side of Pier 1 and the left side of Pier 2) where bed levels at the middle of the piers had dropped by a further 300mm from that recorded in September 2016. Therefore, the bed level at the middle of the left side of Pier 2 has dropped 1200mm since the February 2016 underwater inspection undertaken by UKDS.

Based on the A90 Bridge of Dee Scour Repair and Resilience Report, an estimate of costs for this work, using contract rates from 2016, of £1.6M has been tabled for this work. A council decision on whether a detailed design and estimate is required before this figure is agreed.

River Dee Bridge – Scouring Estimate of £1.6M discussed with Transport Scotland who agreed that reasonable design cost would be covered
Reasonable design cost for Aberdeen City Council to be provided. These are detailed below:

Estimated Construction Cost	£ 1,444,855.00
Recommended Initial Payment 15% of Construction Cost	£ 220,000.00
Management Cost	£ 20,000.00
Advanced Construction Payment	£ 700,000.00
Initial Payment	**£ 940,000.00**

Transport Scotland provided the £700,000 advanced Construction payment with a possible final payment of £660,000. Aberdeen City Council will need to work closely with Transport Scotland during the design, tender and construction to ensure transparency and that final costs can be agreed.

The last General Inspection took place on 07/05/2018 and the following works were identified in the inspection report: -

Span 1 - £20,500
Span 2 - £12,500
Span 3 - £10,000
Span 4 - £12,500
Span 5 - £12,500
Span 6 - £12,500
Span 7 - £12,500
Total = £93,000

Of this total £1,000 was for the removal of graffiti, £5,000 for surfacing and £2,000 for footway repairs leaving **£85,000** of works from the earlier PI. The works identified in this GI were exactly as described in the PI including the estimate.
General comments for each of the spans state that “masonry repairs, stone stitching and crack injection are to be considered to coincide with future scour protection works to the piers/cutwaters.

Appendix C

Anticipated Annual Revenue Expenditure

Below are the expected increased annual revenue budgetary allowances for providing maintenance of the de-trunked A92 and A96. Figures quoted are extrapolated from the actual costs incurred in maintaining the existing road network**.**

Traffic Lights and Pedestrian Crossing

Increased annual maintenance costs	£45,000
Increased Energy costs	£ 7,000
Increased Communication costs	£ 5,000
	£67,000

Lighting Improvements

Increased annual maintenance costs	£ 35,000
Increased Energy costs	£165,500
Column knock downs should be recoverable from driver	£ 0
	£200,500

Winter Maintenance (based on 60 runs per winter + 6 Snow Days).

Additional gritter cost per year	£30,000
Additional maintenance, diesel, insurance etc. of vehicle	£13,900
Additional salt	£22,000
Additional labour	£ 9,500
	£75,400

Ice Detection and Weather Stations

Maintenance & Contract costs of 3 additional stations	£10,000

Footway Patching

Assume per annum.	£20,000

Carriageway Patching

Assume per annum	£60,000

Drainage and Gully Cleaning

Gully cleaning 1115 gullies @ £35	£39,000
Filter drainage 6000m @ £20/m every 5 years	£24,000
Beany blocks drainage	£ 4,000
	£67,000

Bridge Repairs & Inspection

Assume per annum	£ 5,000
Annual Inspections	£ 9,000
Principal Inspections every 6 years (£20,000)	£ 3,600
	£17,600

Road Sign.

Accident Damage should be recoverable from driver	
Annual Maintenance	£ 2,000

Safety Fence

Accident Damage: majority should be recoverable from driver	
Annual Maintenance	£ 4,000

Landscaping

Annual Maintenance	£56,000

Traffic Management

Assume 100 hours of work on road +20hrs overtime. Cost of Traffic Management per hour £315	
Total cost	£ 40,000

Inspections

Safety Inspections, increase public responses	£ 15,000

Depot Overheads

Staff, Personal Protective Equipment (PPE), holidays, Sickness	£ 50,000

Estimated uplift in revenue budgets required	**£684,500**

The adopted assets have been added to the Road Asset Management Plan (RAMP) and will be added to future Capital Works Programme; the inclusion of these additional assets would put further budgetary pressures on the maintenance of the overall network. These figures are based on handover on 1/04/2019.

Road Sign Replacement:

It should be noted that Road Sign Replacement has only been considered on the sections of road network to be de-trunked. No consideration has been given to works that have been necessary on other parts of the road network, such as relating or replacement of signs on the local road network to reflect the operation of the AWPR/B-T project and associated changes in route numbering.